

List No. 6

| | | | |
|---------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|--|
| Chorlton Park Ward | Application Number 080303/LO/2006/S1 | Date of Appln 11th Sep 2006 | Committee Date 15th Feb 2007 |
|---------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|--|

Proposal LISTED BUILDING CONSENT for the conversion and elevational alterations to existing hospital building and extensions and alterations to gate houses and erection of a new part 3, part 4 storey block to form in total 162 apartments and 14 houses with associated car parking and landscaping

Location Former Withington Hospital, Nell Lane, West Didsbury, Manchester, ,

Applicant P J Livesey Group Beacon Road, Trafford Park, Manchester, M17 1FA

Agent Taylor Young Chatsworth House, Wilmslow Road, Handforth, Cheshire, SK9 3HP

Description

This application for Listed Building Consent relates to three buildings and a length of wall/railings and gates forming part of the Withington Hospital Site. The works forming this application are part of a larger scheme for the redevelopment of the final part of the Hospital Site being considered elsewhere on this agenda, ref. 080297/FO/2006/S1

The Withington Hospital site became available for potential redevelopment following a wider strategic rationalisation of healthcare provision in South Manchester. One consequence of this review was the decision to relocate inpatient and accident and emergency services from Withington to an extended Wythenshawe Hospital and Manchester Royal Infirmary. As a result, much of the Withington site became increasingly surplus to requirements. Another consequence was the decision to build a Community Hospital on the site of Burton House, which adjoins the main hospital site across Nell Lane. The majority of the remaining hospital buildings within the main site are now redundant or underused and some have been demolished as services have transferred to other sites.

The site contains a number of buildings of which three are Listed Grade II as being of architectural or historic importance, together with a length of wall/railings and gates. The listed structures are the large three storey cruciform building, the predominantly two storey lodge buildings fronting Nell Lane and the walls/railings and gates linking the lodges. There are 98 trees within the curtilage of the listed buildings. The exteriors of the buildings, which were originally built as a workhouse in the early to mid 1800's, are largely unaltered, although both the front lodges have been extended by later buildings. Some of the later extensions on the west side are in the same Italianate style as the original buildings and are of some merit. The other extensions, which all date from the 20th century, are of little historic or architectural significance.

The interiors of the Chapel and the dining hall, the original principle spaces of the workhouse, have been substantially altered and their original character has

List No. 6

been lost, although it is possible that the original ornamental roof trusses of the chapel survive hidden by later inserted structures.

The internal plan of the main ward ranges is still clear, despite alterations and the interiors retain some original features, including several iron stairs although some of the flights have been removed. There is very little decorative ornament and any original decorative features, such as chimney pieces have long ago been removed.

Hayley , Son and Hall, the architects of the building were not a major firm of national standing, but had a good local reputation in public works. Their design is impressive for its large size and the planning is competent and practical, though the design was not at all innovative. The building is of considerable significance as a good example of a large corridor-plan workhouse.

The listed cruciform building would be renovated to form 99 self contained flats of which 45 would be one bed, 43 two bed and 11 three bed. In addition to the renovation of the building a new glazed entrance feature will be created in the gable of the northern arm of the cruciform. Four sets of balconies in a contemporary style would be constructed on the northern elevation of the central axis. Within the northern and southern wings some of the proposed flats would be accommodated in pods, designed so that it will remain possible to appreciate the scale and architectural features of the original large open voids. Within the buildings demolition of walls will be kept to a minimum, retaining the substantive part of the historic fabric of the building. Refuse and recycling facilities will be provided within the building and will be managed by a janitor. The landscaped areas to the south of the main building will be remodelled and retained as amenity space.

The Eastern lodge building would be subject to an extension on the existing roof and some alterations to the elevations to provide additional windows and doors. The existing walls railings and gates would be retained and provide a pedestrian entrance into the site. The western lodge would have a two storey extension at its western end. The two lodges would be converted into 14 houses and 17 flats of which 6 would be one bed. The existing amenity space between the lodges and Nell lane will be retained.

To the west of the listed buildings, Livesey's propose to erect a part three part four storey block comprising 30 one bed, 13 two bed and 4 three bed apartments. The building would be contemporary in its styling with car parking in a semi basement. The block would be parallel to the site access road from which access would be taken. It would also be the main entrance to the converted cruciform building.

Both the new build and the cruciform building would be provided with lifts. The new build would be capable of being made fully accessible. 80% of the converted accommodation would be accessible by lift and capable of some degree of disabled access.

A total of 223 car parking spaces would be provided in this part of the development. It would be located in the semi-basement of the new build, in two car parks partially underground with car deck above located either side of the northern wing of the cruciform building. The remaining car parking is distributed

List No. 6

in small pockets of two to four spaces within the site. The Livesey development would be enclosed by 1.8 metre high railings.

Consultations

Local Residents- whilst seven letters were received in respect of the proposed development none raised issues relating to the listed buildings.

West Didsbury Residents Association - are particularly impressed with the plans for the conversion of the former Home 4 building, which should result in a tasteful restoration that will considerably improve the appearance of the building. They do have a number of concerns about the treatment of the listed buildings and the landscaping:-

1. They are concerned about the proposed glazed north entrance, which they feel will be incongruous.
2. They are concerned that pipework to the kitchens/bathrooms on some of the conversions will detract from the appearance of the building.
3. They request that only sustainably sourced timber is used.
4. Substantial comments have been submitted suggesting improvements to the landscape proposals.
5. They are concerned over the loss of trees and feel it is unclear if some trees identified as suitable for transplanting are to be so.

Historic Buildings and Conservation Areas Panel - The Panel noted the poor quality of the submission, finding it to be generally lacking in detail and justification. A much more detailed submission is needed which fully explains and justifies the full impact of the proposals on the listed buildings and site.

The Panel considered the proposed conversion of the former hospital-ward blocks to be generally acceptable in principle, but subject to the submission of full and accurate details.

The nature and manner of the proposed conversion of the former Chapel and Assembly Hall was not considered to be acceptable, and it was noted that better models exist for the conversion of double and triple-height spaces and volumes, based on self-contained pods.

The conversion and extensions to the east and west gate-houses and wings need a more sympathetic approach, responding better to the building's historic character.

It was considered that the proposed add-on elements and extensions to all the existing buildings, including balconies, canopies, porches, frames and roofs need more consideration and need to offer more honest and contemporary solutions.

The Panel enquired about the designs for the new housing element of the overall scheme. The Panel noted that Thomas Worthington had also designed social housing schemes. It was recommended that clues could be taken from Worthington's work to inform this aspect of the development.

Recommend - Negotiate as above/ refuse as submitted.

List No. 6

English Heritage - The application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance.

Issues

Unitary development Plan-the relevant policy within the Unitary Development plan is:-

DC19 which looks to ensure that new development does have an adverse impact on listed buildings or their settings.

Regional Spatial Strategy- Policy UR1 identifies the sustainable regeneration of the region's urban areas as a clear priority. Emphasis is placed on the reuse of derelict land and buildings, the balanced distribution of good quality dwellings and access to employment and community facilities.

Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 - "Planning and the Historic Environment" - The guidance notes states:-

Paragraph 2.14 " The design of new buildings intended to stand alongside historic buildings needs very careful consideration. In general it is better that old buildings are not set apart but woven into the fabric of the living and working community."

Paragraph 3.12 "...where new uses are proposed it is important to balance the effect of change on the special interest of the listed building against the viability of any proposed use and of alternative, and possibly less damaging, uses. In judging the effect of any alteration and extension it is essential to have assessed the elements that make up the special interest of the building in question."

Principle - the conversion works to the Listed Buildings have been the subject of lengthy discussions between the developers and officers. The current scheme manages to blend the retention of the majority of the historic fabric of the buildings with modern interventions in the form of the pods within the large voids and the new entrance and balconies in the cruciform building and the modest extensions to the lodges. This approach has enabled a high quality scheme to be produced that will ensure the future of the listed buildings, and in doing so has managed to provide imaginative houses as well as flats.

Cruciform Building - Externally the building will remain largely as its is at present. The significant alterations being the introduction of a large glazed entrance into the gable of the north wing of the property and the introduction of four metal towers to provide balconies to some of the proposed flats. Both these interventions adopt a minimalist approach to their design and will not detract from the character of the main building. Internally the conversion of the building into flats will enable the retention of most of the historic fabric of the buildings.

List No. 6

Within the large voids found in the north and south wings it is proposed to introduce "pods", which will house the living accommodation. This approach, which has been used successfully in other listed buildings retains the ability to get a feel for the original spaces and to view features such as roof trusses, whilst bringing the space into use. Overall the approach adopted is considered acceptable. However, some further work is still required in relation to the detailed design of the "pods".

West Lodge - the proposal involves the erection of a first floor and three storey extension at one end of the lodge, in a contemporary style. Again there would be some elevational alterations to the building though these are designed to reflect the proportions of the existing openings. The enlarged building would be converted into 8 houses and 10 flats.

East Lodge - it is proposed to create a first floor extension to this building which would be converted into 6 houses and 7 flats. The extension is set back on the existing flat roof and is unobtrusive. Otherwise it is proposed to introduce new openings, in the style of the originals to form doors and windows. The proposed changes do not significantly affect the historic fabric but enable the successful conversion of the property. It is proposed to create five houses and four flats within the building.

Car Parking - to provide an adequate level of parking for the amount of accommodation proposed could clearly have a significant impact on the setting of the listed buildings. To overcome this it is proposed to create a sunken car park with a parking deck above. Whilst this approach has implications for 14 trees in the courtyards to the northern side of the building, it substantially reduces the amount of hard surface required and coupled with a comprehensive landscaping scheme including new trees will not be detrimental to the setting of the listed building.

Landscaping - A landscaping scheme has been submitted which provides for rejuvenating the retained courtyards, together with providing a comprehensive tree planting scheme.

Conclusion - The proposed development retains the essential character and appearance of these important listed buildings. Intervention is kept to a minimum as is the loss of historic fabric, whilst the existing landscaped setting will benefit from the new planting that is proposed. The proposed use will ensure a long term future for the buildings. The Head of Planning believes that this is a quality scheme that will secure the future of the buildings.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations - This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have the right to a fair hearing and to this end the Committee must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Unitary Development Plan, the Head of Planning has concluded that some rights

List No. 6

conferred by these Articles on the applicant(s)/objectors/residents and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. He believes that any restriction on these rights posed by approval of the application is proportionate to the wider benefits of approval and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation MINDED TO APPROVE Subject to the granting of planning permission 080297/FO/2006/S1

on the basis that the proposal is in accord with the City Councils unitary Development Plan in particular Policy Dc19 and there are no material considerations of sufficient weight to indicate otherwise

Conditions and/or Reasons

1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of five years beginning with the date of this permission.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the drawings numbered , stamped as received by the Local Planning Authority on , unless otherwise agreed in writing by the City Council as Local Planning Authority.

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans pursuant to policy DC19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester

3) Construction of the works hereby approved by this permission shall not take place until samples and specifications of the materials to be used on all external elevations of the development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The development shall be constructed only using the approved materials unless otherwise agreed in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason

To ensure that the appearance of the development is acceptable to the City Council as local planning authority in the interests of the visual amenity of the area within which the site is located pursuant to policy DC19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester .

4) The landscaping scheme approved by the City Council as local planning authority shown on drawing ref ***** , shall be implemented not later than 12 months from the date of commencement of works. Any trees or shrubs removed, dying or becoming severely damaged or becoming severely diseased within 3 years of planting shall be replaced by trees or shrubs of a similar size

List No. 6

or species to those originally required to be planted unless otherwise agreed in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason

To ensure that a satisfactory landscaping scheme for the development is carried out pursuant to policy DC19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester .

5) In this condition "retained tree" means an existing tree on site which is to be retained and a tree on a neighbouring site whose root structure extends into The site as shown on plan number and any replacement tree planted under paragraph (c) below; and paragraphs (a), (b) and (c) below shall have effect until the expiration of 1 year from the date of first occupation of the building hereby approved.

(a) No retained tree shall be cut down, uprooted or destroyed.

(b) No retained tree shall be topped or lopped other than in accordance a scheme (which is in accord with British Standard 5837:2005) previously approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority and following the City Council's previous written approval.

(c) If any retained tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed or dies, another tree shall be planted at the same place as soon as reasonably possible and that tree shall be of such size and species, as may be specified in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

(d) All retained trees shall be protected in accordance with a scheme (which is in accord with British Standard 5837:2005) previously approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority before any equipment, machinery or materials are brought on to the site. The approved protection shall be maintained until all equipment, machinery and surplus materials have been removed from the site. Nothing shall be stored or placed in any area fenced in accordance with this condition and the ground levels within those areas shall not be altered, nor shall any excavation be made, without the written consent of the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason

In order avoid damage to trees/shrubs adjacent to and within the site which are of important amenity value to the area pursuant to policies pursuant to policy DC19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester

6) Before the works hereby granted listed buildings consent are commenced on site and having regard to the details given in the approved drawings, accurate annotated drawings detailing the soft stripout of any parts of any of the listed buildings which are currently obscured by suspended ceilings, partitions, etc. and detailing how such detail is to be affected by the proposals, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason

List No. 6

In the interests of visual amenity, and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest so careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building pursuant to policy DC19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

7) Before the development commences a schedule of works to facilitate any refurbishment/repair of the existing roof, including details of any replacement roof covering, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The existing natural roof slates shall be re-used wherever possible. Any replacement roof covering shall be of natural slate which shall match the existing slates in terms of origin, size, shape, texture and colour.

Reason

In the interests of visual amenity, and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest so careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

8) Before the works hereby granted listed building consent are commenced on site and having regard to the details given in the approved drawings, accurate annotated drawings detailing any internal stripout works, the internal works required to implement any service compartmentation, acoustic insulation, thermal insulation, fire protection and fume extraction measures associated with the listed building, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. Drawings shall include details of:

- a) the location and design of such works, including external finishing materials, their finishes and colours;
- b) the relationship between these proposed works and the existing listed structure, including the means of affixing the proposed works to the existing structure.

Reason

In the interests of visual amenity, and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest so careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester..

9) Before the works commence full details, specifications and justification of the method to be used to clean the brickwork and to carry out any repairs to existing masonry shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The method proposed shall not include mechanical means, such as the use of cutting or grinding discs, to rake out mortar joints unless agreed in writing by the Council as local planning authority.

List No. 6

Reason

In the interests of visual amenity and the because proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester..

10) Before the development commences full details of the proposed rooflights to be used shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Council as local planning authority. The rooflights shall be 'conservation' style rooflights which lie close to the plane of the roof.

Reason

In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester..

11) All new rainwater goods and pipes shall be constructed of cast iron and coloured black and shall kept so coloured unless agreed otherwise by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason

In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester..

12) Before the works commence a schedule of works to facilitate any refurbishment/repair of existing windows shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. Such works should not include for the removal or replacement of any original windows unless otherwise approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority and any such proposal shall be accompanied by a full justification for such works, including a structural survey, details of why repair and refurbishment of such windows is not viable and details, including materials and cross sections, of any proposed replacement windows.

Reason

In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester..

13) Before development commences, details of any works (including to the windows, floors or walls) to be undertaken in relation to a scheme for acoustic

List No. 6

insulation, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason

To safeguard the character and appearance of the listed building pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

14) Before development commences, a full photographic record of the site and the building (internally and externally) including all areas where physical changes are proposed, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason

To provide a record of any archaeological remains and of the listed building's appearance and condition before works commence pursuant to policy Dc19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester..

Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

The documents referred to in the course of this report are either contained in the file(s) relating to application ref: 080303/LO/2006/S1 held by Planning or are City Council planning policies, the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester, national planning guidance documents, or relevant decisions on other applications or appeals, copies of which are all held by the Planning Division.

The following residents, businesses and other third parties in the area were consulted on the application:

English Heritage (NW Region)
The Victorian Society
West Didsbury Residents Association

Approximately 1,200 properties surrounding the application site were sent notification letters.

Representations were received from the following third parties:

English heritage
West Didsbury Residents Association

| | |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Relevant Contact Officer: | : Dave Morris |
| Telephone No. | : (0161) 234 4539 |
| Email | : d.morris@manchester.gov.uk |